

September 18, 2019

Mr. Chuck Williams, PE
 City Engineer
 City of Moab
 217 East Center Street
 Moab, Utah 84532

Subject: North Sewer Line Project

Dear Chuck:

We have completed our review of contractors' bids received and opened on September 12, 2019 based on the information provided us by the City. Below is a summary of our review. A copy of the Bid Tabulation is attached.

Table 1
Bid Amounts

Schedule	Hank Williams, Inc.	Condie Construction, Inc.	Phaze Concrete, Inc.
A – Complete Project	\$1,531,523.90	\$1,566,182.00	\$1,666,731.43
A with B ¹	\$1,654,609.07	\$1,689,705.00	\$1,805,660.24
C – Reach 1 Only	\$1,313,402.36	\$1,331,779.00	\$1,429,381.93
C with D ²	\$1,373,384.09	\$1,432,853.00	\$1,539,887.72

Notes:

1. Bid Items A8, A9, A13 and A14 have been replaced with bid alternate items B8, B9, B13 and B14.
2. Bid Items C8, C9, C13 and C14 have been replaced with bid alternate items D8, D9, D13 and D14.

In review of these bid amounts, it is our recommendation that the City selects the option of constructing Schedule A with B which will include replacing all concrete manholes with polymer manholes, including the wet well, in order to protect this infrastructure from potential corrosion.

In review of each bidder's bid packet, the following items were identified as either missing or incomplete:

For Hank Williams, Inc.:

- Project schedule provided was incomplete. Only first page of schedule was provided.
- No superintendent was identified, however, resumes for three superintendents were provided.

- Question regarding claims, disputes or litigation pending or outstanding was left unanswered in the Bidder's Qualification Section. Note: I have reached out to their VP (Ward Priestley) and he said they are currently involved in one legal battle. Hank Williams, Inc. has issued a claim against a general contractor they did work for and the general contractor has not paid them for the work they performed. Attached is a letter regarding that legal battle for the City's reference.

For Condie Construction, Inc.:

- No project schedule was provided.
- No resumes for the two foreman listed was provided.

For Phaze Concrete, Inc.:

- No superintendent was identified. Therefore, no resume for a superintendent was provided.
- No State of Utah Business License provided.

Other than those items listed above, each bidder's packet was deemed complete. It is our professional opinion that regardless of who the City selects for the project, that bidder should be given the opportunity to provide the missing information within a reasonable timeframe after the bid opening.

Hank Williams, Inc. is the apparent low bidder regardless of which project schedule(s) are chosen by the City to be performed for this project. Per the request of the City, we have contacted a reference Hank Williams, Inc. provided in their bid packet and the reference provided us with positive feedback and stated that they would work with them again in the future. Based on this information, as well as, our previous experience working with Condie Construction, we recommend that either Hank Williams, Inc. or Condie Construction be considered for the project.

Please contact me if you have any questions or need additional information.

Sincerely,

Bowen, Collins and Associates



Steven Meyer, P.E.
Project Engineer

cc: Jeff Beckman, BC&A Project Manager

Bid Tabulation
North Sewer Line Project
City of Moab
Bid Opening: September 12, 2019

Schedule A - Complete Project				Engineer's Estimate		Bidder Average		Hank Williams, Inc.		Condie Construction Co., Inc.		Phaze Concrete, Inc.		Cost Difference		
No.	Bid Item	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	%
A1	Mobilization & Demobilization	1	LS	\$ 154,254.00	\$ 154,254.00	\$ 169,774.48	\$ 169,774.48	\$ 146,946.21	\$ 146,946.21	\$ 261,312.00	\$ 261,312.00	\$ 101,065.24	\$ 101,065.24	\$ 15,520.48	\$ 15,520.48	10%
A2	Traffic Control	1	LS	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 21,824.84	\$ 21,824.84	\$ 28,359.15	\$ 28,359.15	\$ 19,549.00	\$ 19,549.00	\$ 17,566.38	\$ 17,566.38	\$ 16,824.84	\$ 16,824.84	336%
A3	Temporary Controls	1	LS	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 45,896.58	\$ 45,896.58	\$ 54,464.90	\$ 54,464.90	\$ 18,611.00	\$ 18,611.00	\$ 64,613.83	\$ 64,613.83	\$ 20,896.58	\$ 20,896.58	84%
A4	Quality Control & Testing	1	LS	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 20,308.04	\$ 20,308.04	\$ 16,540.82	\$ 16,540.82	\$ 15,106.00	\$ 15,106.00	\$ 29,277.30	\$ 29,277.30	\$ 5,308.04	\$ 5,308.04	35%
A5	Construction Layout & Staking	1	LS	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 18,717.15	\$ 18,717.15	\$ 14,576.89	\$ 14,576.89	\$ 7,997.00	\$ 7,997.00	\$ 33,577.55	\$ 33,577.55	\$ 16,717.15	\$ 16,717.15	836%
A6	Install Force Main - 6-inch PE4710 DIPS DR21	650	LF	\$ 100.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 45,500.00	\$ 56.06	\$ 36,439.00	\$ 82.20	\$ 53,430.00	\$ 71.74	\$ 46,631.00	\$ (30.00)	\$ (19,500.00)	-30%
A7	Install Gravity Sanitary Sewer Main - 15-inch ASTM 3034 SDR 35 PVC	2,930	LF	\$ 250.00	\$ 732,500.00	\$ 113.38	\$ 332,193.63	\$ 66.96	\$ 196,192.80	\$ 125.00	\$ 366,250.00	\$ 148.17	\$ 434,138.10	\$ (136.62)	\$ (400,306.37)	-55%
A8	Install 4-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base	1	EA	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 5,393.03	\$ 5,393.03	\$ 6,101.38	\$ 6,101.38	\$ 7,005.00	\$ 7,005.00	\$ 3,072.72	\$ 3,072.72	\$ (606.97)	\$ (606.97)	-10%
A9	Install 5-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base	9	EA	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 63,000.00	\$ 6,271.51	\$ 56,443.56	\$ 7,499.19	\$ 67,492.71	\$ 7,094.00	\$ 63,846.00	\$ 4,221.33	\$ 37,991.97	\$ (728.49)	\$ (6,556.44)	-10%
A10	Holiday Inn's Sewer Lateral Extension	550	LF	\$ 100.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 107.77	\$ 59,275.33	\$ 70.83	\$ 38,956.50	\$ 131.00	\$ 72,050.00	\$ 121.49	\$ 66,819.50	\$ 7.77	\$ 4,275.33	8%
A11	Aarchway Inn's Sewer Lateral Extension	260	LF	\$ 120.00	\$ 31,200.00	\$ 127.85	\$ 33,240.13	\$ 79.64	\$ 20,706.40	\$ 158.00	\$ 41,080.00	\$ 145.90	\$ 37,934.00	\$ 7.85	\$ 2,040.13	7%
A12	Install Trench Dike	9	EA	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 1,727.17	\$ 15,544.56	\$ 1,812.05	\$ 16,308.45	\$ 1,988.00	\$ 17,892.00	\$ 1,381.47	\$ 12,433.23	\$ 727.17	\$ 6,544.56	73%
A13	Install 5-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base and Connect to Existing Sewer Line	1	EA	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 14,422.20	\$ 14,422.20	\$ 12,117.06	\$ 12,117.06	\$ 7,982.00	\$ 7,982.00	\$ 23,167.53	\$ 23,167.53	\$ 6,422.20	\$ 6,422.20	80%
A14	Pump Station and Valve Vault	1	LS	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 341,778.05	\$ 341,778.05	\$ 430,240.26	\$ 430,240.26	\$ 284,790.00	\$ 284,790.00	\$ 310,303.90	\$ 310,303.90	\$ 121,778.05	\$ 121,778.05	55%
A15	Abandon Existing Pump Station and Force Main	2	EA	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 5,267.45	\$ 10,534.89	\$ 7,456.84	\$ 14,913.68	\$ 4,824.00	\$ 9,648.00	\$ 3,521.50	\$ 7,043.00	\$ (4,732.55)	\$ (9,465.11)	-47%
A16	Relocate Existing 3-inch Gas Line	45	LF	\$ 130.00	\$ 5,850.00	\$ 105.55	\$ 4,749.75	\$ 129.54	\$ 5,829.30	\$ 70.00	\$ 3,150.00	\$ 117.11	\$ 5,269.95	\$ (24.45)	\$ (1,100.25)	-19%
A17	Transport and Install Red Rock Boulders	40	CY	\$ 100.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 173.77	\$ 6,950.67	\$ 121.21	\$ 4,848.40	\$ 264.00	\$ 10,560.00	\$ 136.09	\$ 5,443.60	\$ 73.77	\$ 2,950.67	74%
A18	Asphalt Pavement Restoration	15,000	SF	\$ 5.50	\$ 82,500.00	\$ 10.34	\$ 155,050.00	\$ 10.29	\$ 154,350.00	\$ 10.30	\$ 154,500.00	\$ 10.42	\$ 156,300.00	\$ 4.84	\$ 72,550.00	88%
A19	Unimproved Surface Restoration	80,400	SF	\$ 0.20	\$ 16,080.00	\$ 0.42	\$ 34,036.00	\$ 0.83	\$ 66,732.00	\$ 0.20	\$ 16,080.00	\$ 0.24	\$ 19,296.00	\$ 0.22	\$ 17,956.00	112%
A20	Landscape Restoration	93,000	SF	\$ 0.50	\$ 46,500.00	\$ 0.79	\$ 73,780.00	\$ 1.01	\$ 93,930.00	\$ 0.20	\$ 18,600.00	\$ 1.17	\$ 108,810.00	\$ 0.29	\$ 27,280.00	59%
A21	Gravel Road Restoration	21,500	SF	\$ 1.50	\$ 32,250.00	\$ 0.95	\$ 20,353.33	\$ 1.04	\$ 22,360.00	\$ 1.00	\$ 21,500.00	\$ 0.80	\$ 17,200.00	\$ (0.55)	\$ (11,896.67)	-37%
A22	Wetland Restoration	1,450	SF	\$ 0.25	\$ 0.25	\$ 15.17	\$ 22,001.33	\$ 8.71	\$ 12,629.50	\$ 3.90	\$ 5,655.00	\$ 32.91	\$ 47,719.50	\$ 14.92	\$ 22,001.08	8800433%
A23	Owner Selected Integrator (Dorsett Technologies)	1	LS	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ -	\$ -	0%
A24	Overhead and Profit for Owner Selected Integrator	1	LS	\$ 4,600.00	\$ 4,600.00	\$ 4,200.45	\$ 4,200.45	\$ 4,134.35	\$ 4,134.35	\$ 5,397.00	\$ 5,397.00	\$ 3,070.00	\$ 3,070.00	\$ (399.55)	\$ (399.55)	-9%
A25	Relocate Existing 6-inch Irrigation Line	400	LF	\$ 70.00	\$ 28,000.00	\$ 54.15	\$ 21,658.67	\$ 36.14	\$ 14,456.00	\$ 62.20	\$ 24,880.00	\$ 64.10	\$ 25,640.00	\$ (15.85)	\$ (6,341.33)	-23%
A26	Power Supply for Pump Station	1	LS	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 23,819.09	\$ 23,819.09	\$ 21,198.14	\$ 21,198.14	\$ 28,612.00	\$ 28,612.00	\$ 21,647.13	\$ 21,647.13	\$ (11,180.91)	\$ (11,180.91)	-32%
TOTAL OF ALL ITEM UNIT PRICES FOR SCHEDULE A - COMPLETE PROJECT					\$ 1,696,434.25		\$ 1,588,145.78		\$ 1,531,523.90		\$ 1,566,182.00		\$ 1,666,731.43	\$ -	\$ (164,910.35)	-10%

Schedule B - Complete Project - Bid Alternate No. 1				Bidder Average		Hank Williams, Inc.		Condie Construction Co., Inc.		Phaze Concrete, Inc.	
No.	Bid Item	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
B8	Install 4-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base	1	EA	\$ 11,714.23	\$ 11,714.23	\$ 11,907.25	\$ 11,907.25	\$ 12,916.00	\$ 12,916.00	\$ 10,319.45	\$ 10,319.45
B9	Install 5-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base	9	EA	\$ 15,160.22	\$ 136,441.95	\$ 17,207.98	\$ 154,871.82	\$ 14,577.00	\$ 131,193.00	\$ 13,695.67	\$ 123,261.03
B13	Install 5-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base and Connect to Existing Sewer Line	1	EA	\$ 21,934.33	\$ 21,934.33	\$ 16,210.61	\$ 16,210.61	\$ 17,204.00	\$ 17,204.00	\$ 32,388.39	\$ 32,388.39
B14	Install 8-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole for the Pump Station Wet Well and Valve Vault	1	LS	\$ 376,458.65	\$ 376,458.65	\$ 456,046.90	\$ 456,046.90	\$ 325,833.00	\$ 325,833.00	\$ 347,496.06	\$ 347,496.06
TOTAL OF ALL ITEM UNIT PRICES FOR SCHEDULE B - COMPLETE PROJECT - BID ALTERNATE NO. 1					\$ 546,549.17		\$ 639,036.58		\$ 487,146.00		\$ 513,464.93

TOTAL PRICE INCLUDING SCHEDULES A WITH SCHEDULE B ITEMS (Note: Items A8, A9, A13 and A14 are replaced with B8, B9, B13 & B14)						\$ 1,654,609.07	\$ 1,689,705.00	\$ 1,805,660.24
--	--	--	--	--	--	-----------------	-----------------	-----------------

Note 1: Low bid
Note 2: Correction to numerical discrepancy in bid.

Prepared by:
Bowen, Collins and Associates
September 13, 2019

Bid Tabulation
North Sewer Line Project
City of Moab
Bid Opening: September 12, 2019

Schedule C - Reach 1 Only				Engineer's Estimate		Bidder Average		Hank Williams, Inc.		Condie Construction Co., Inc.		Phaze Concrete, Inc.		Cost Difference		
No.	Bid Item	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	%
C1	Mobilization & Demobilization	1	LS	\$ 154,254.00	\$ 154,254.00	\$ 155,284.64	\$ 155,284.64	\$ 130,673.67	\$ 130,673.67	\$ 234,115.00	\$ 234,115.00	\$ 101,065.24	\$ 101,065.24	\$ 1,030.64	\$ 1,030.64	1%
C2	Traffic Control	1	LS	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 18,168.01	\$ 18,168.01	\$ 17,388.65	\$ 17,388.65	\$ 19,549.00	\$ 19,549.00	\$ 17,566.38	\$ 17,566.38	\$ 13,168.01	\$ 13,168.01	263%
C3	Temporary Controls	1	LS	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 45,896.47	\$ 45,896.47	\$ 54,464.59	\$ 54,464.59	\$ 18,611.00	\$ 18,611.00	\$ 64,613.83	\$ 64,613.83	\$ 20,896.47	\$ 20,896.47	84%
C4	Quality Control & Testing	1	LS	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 18,980.05	\$ 18,980.05	\$ 12,556.85	\$ 12,556.85	\$ 15,106.00	\$ 15,106.00	\$ 29,277.30	\$ 29,277.30	\$ 3,980.05	\$ 3,980.05	27%
C5	Construction Layout & Staking	1	LS	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 17,968.98	\$ 17,968.98	\$ 12,332.40	\$ 12,332.40	\$ 7,997.00	\$ 7,997.00	\$ 33,577.55	\$ 33,577.55	\$ 15,968.98	\$ 15,968.98	798%
C6	Install Force Main - 6-inch PE4710 DIPS DR21	650	LF	\$ 100.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 70.23	\$ 45,651.67	\$ 56.76	\$ 36,894.00	\$ 82.20	\$ 53,430.00	\$ 71.74	\$ 46,631.00	\$ (29.77)	\$ (19,348.33)	-30%
C7	Install Gravity Sanitary Sewer Main - 15-inch ASTM 3034 SDR 35 PVC	1,620	LF	\$ 250.00	\$ 405,000.00	\$ 120.36	\$ 194,983.20	\$ 61.08	\$ 98,949.60	\$ 125.00	\$ 202,500.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 283,500.00	\$ (129.64)	\$ (210,016.80)	-52%
C8	Install 4-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base	1	EA	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 5,393.03	\$ 5,393.03	\$ 6,101.38	\$ 6,101.38	\$ 7,005.00	\$ 7,005.00	\$ 3,072.72	\$ 3,072.72	\$ (606.97)	\$ (606.97)	-10%
C9	Install 5-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base	6	EA	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 42,000.00	\$ 5,909.10	\$ 35,454.62	\$ 6,411.98	\$ 38,471.88	\$ 7,094.00	\$ 42,564.00	\$ 4,221.33	\$ 25,327.98	\$ (1,090.90)	\$ (6,545.38)	-16%
C10	Holiday Inn's Sewer Lateral Extension	550	LF	\$ 100.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 107.77	\$ 59,275.33	\$ 70.83	\$ 38,956.50	\$ 131.00	\$ 72,050.00	\$ 121.49	\$ 66,819.50	\$ 7.77	\$ 4,275.33	8%
C11	Aarchway Inn's Sewer Lateral Extension	260	LF	\$ 120.00	\$ 31,200.00	\$ 127.85	\$ 33,240.13	\$ 79.64	\$ 20,706.40	\$ 158.00	\$ 41,080.00	\$ 145.90	\$ 37,934.00	\$ 7.85	\$ 2,040.13	7%
C12	Install Trench Dike	6	EA	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 1,727.14	\$ 10,362.84	\$ 1,811.95	\$ 10,871.70	\$ 1,988.00	\$ 11,928.00	\$ 1,381.47	\$ 8,288.82	\$ 727.14	\$ 4,362.84	73%
C13	Install 5-foot Standard Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Precast Base and Connect to Existing Sewer Line	1	EA	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 13,786.79	\$ 13,786.79	\$ 10,210.84	\$ 10,210.84	\$ 7,982.00	\$ 7,982.00	\$ 23,167.53	\$ 23,167.53	\$ 5,786.79	\$ 5,786.79	72%
C14	Pump Station and Valve Vault	1	LS	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 347,271.81	\$ 347,271.81	\$ 446,721.53	\$ 446,721.53	\$ 284,790.00	\$ 284,790.00	\$ 310,303.90	\$ 310,303.90	\$ 127,271.81	\$ 127,271.81	58%
C15	Abandon Existing Pump Station and Force Main	2	EA	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 5,267.45	\$ 10,534.89	\$ 7,456.84	\$ 14,913.68	\$ 4,824.00	\$ 9,648.00	\$ 3,521.50	\$ 7,043.00	\$ (4,732.55)	\$ (9,465.11)	-47%
C16	Relocate Existing 3-inch Gas Line	45	LF	\$ 130.00	\$ 5,850.00	\$ 105.55	\$ 4,749.75	\$ 129.54	\$ 5,829.30	\$ 70.00	\$ 3,150.00	\$ 117.11	\$ 5,269.95	\$ (24.45)	\$ (1,100.25)	-19%
C17	Transport and Install Red Rock Boulders	40	CY	\$ 100.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 173.77	\$ 6,950.67	\$ 121.21	\$ 4,848.40	\$ 264.00	\$ 10,560.00	\$ 136.09	\$ 5,443.60	\$ 73.77	\$ 2,950.67	74%
C18	Asphalt Pavement Restoration	15,000	SF	\$ 5.50	\$ 82,500.00	\$ 10.34	\$ 155,050.00	\$ 10.29	\$ 154,350.00	\$ 10.30	\$ 154,500.00	\$ 10.42	\$ 156,300.00	\$ 4.84	\$ 72,550.00	88%
C19	Unimproved Surface Restoration	46,000	SF	\$ 0.20	\$ 9,200.00	\$ 0.42	\$ 19,473.33	\$ 0.83	\$ 38,180.00	\$ 0.20	\$ 9,200.00	\$ 0.24	\$ 11,040.00	\$ 0.22	\$ 10,273.33	112%
C20	Landscape Restoration	60,000	SF	\$ 0.50	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 0.79	\$ 47,600.00	\$ 1.01	\$ 60,600.00	\$ 0.20	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 1.17	\$ 70,200.00	\$ 0.29	\$ 17,600.00	59%
C21	Gravel Road Restoration	21,500	SF	\$ 1.50	\$ 32,250.00	\$ 0.95	\$ 20,353.33	\$ 1.04	\$ 22,360.00	\$ 1.00	\$ 21,500.00	\$ 0.80	\$ 17,200.00	\$ (0.55)	\$ (11,896.67)	-37%
C22	Wetland Restoration	750	SF	\$ 0.25	\$ 0.25	\$ 15.17	\$ 11,380.00	\$ 8.71	\$ 6,532.50	\$ 3.90	\$ 2,925.00	\$ 32.91	\$ 24,682.50	\$ 14.92	\$ 11,379.75	4551900%
C23	Owner Selected Integrator (Dorsett Technologies)	1	LS	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ 30,700.00	\$ -	\$ -	0%
C24	Overhead and Profit for Owner Selected Integrator	1	LS	\$ 4,600.00	\$ 4,600.00	\$ 4,200.45	\$ 4,200.45	\$ 4,134.35	\$ 4,134.35	\$ 5,397.00	\$ 5,397.00	\$ 3,070.00	\$ 3,070.00	\$ (399.55)	\$ (399.55)	-9%
C25	Relocate Existing 6-inch Irrigation Line	400	LF	\$ 70.00	\$ 28,000.00	\$ 54.15	\$ 21,658.67	\$ 36.14	\$ 14,456.00	\$ 62.20	\$ 24,880.00	\$ 64.10	\$ 25,640.00	\$ (15.85)	\$ (6,341.33)	-23%
C26	Power Supply for Pump Station	1	LS	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	\$ 23,819.09	\$ 23,819.09	\$ 21,198.14	\$ 21,198.14	\$ 28,612.00	\$ 28,612.00	\$ 21,647.13	\$ 21,647.13	\$ (11,180.91)	\$ (11,180.91)	-32%
TOTAL OF ALL ITEM UNIT PRICES FOR SCHEDULE C - REACH 1 ONLY					\$ 1,321,554.25		\$ 1,358,187.76		\$ 1,313,402.36		\$ 1,331,779.00		\$ 1,429,381.93	\$ -	\$ (8,151.89)	-1%

Schedule D - Reach 1 Only - Bid Alternate No. 2				Bidder Average		Hank Williams, Inc.		Condie Construction Co., Inc.		Phaze Concrete, Inc.	
No.	Bid Item	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
D8	Install 4-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base	1	EA	\$ 11,714.23	\$ 11,714.23	\$ 11,907.25	\$ 11,907.25	\$ 12,916.00	\$ 12,916.00	\$ 10,319.45	\$ 10,319.45
D9	Install 5-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base	6	EA	\$ 13,614.81	\$ 81,688.84	\$ 12,571.75	\$ 75,430.50	\$ 14,577.00	\$ 87,462.00	\$ 13,695.67	\$ 82,174.02
D13	Install 5-foot Polymer Concrete Sewer Manhole w/ Polymer Base and Connect to Existing Sewer Line	1	EA	\$ 21,934.33	\$ 21,934.33	\$ 16,210.61	\$ 16,210.61	\$ 17,204.00	\$ 17,204.00	\$ 32,388.39	\$ 32,388.39
D14	Install 8-foot Polymer Concrete Manhole for the Pump Station Wet Well and Valve Vault	1	LS	\$ 377,089.35	\$ 377,089.35	\$ 457,939.00	\$ 457,939.00	\$ 325,833.00	\$ 325,833.00	\$ 347,496.06	\$ 347,496.06
TOTAL OF ALL ITEM UNIT PRICES FOR SCHEDULE D - REACH 1 ONLY - BID ALTERNATE NO. 2					\$ 492,426.76		\$ 561,487.36		\$ 443,415.00		\$ 472,377.92

TOTAL PRICE INCLUDING SCHEDULES C WITH SCHEDULE D ITEMS (Note: Items C8, C9, CA13 and C14 are replaced with D8, D9, D13 & D14)								\$ 1,373,384.09		\$ 1,432,853.00		\$ 1,539,887.72
---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	-----------------	--	-----------------	--	-----------------

Note 1: Low bid
Note 2: Correction to numerical discrepancy in bid.

Prepared by:
Bowen, Collins and Associates
September 13, 2019

Steven Meyer

From: Ward Priestley <ward@williamsconstruction.biz>
Sent: Friday, September 13, 2019 12:40 PM
To: Steven Meyer
Cc: Ward Priestley
Subject: Williams Construction Legal History

Follow Up Flag: FollowUp
Flag Status: Flagged

Mr. Meyer,

Williams Construction is currently involved in one legal case. This is the first lawsuit that Hank Williams, Inc. has ever brought forth (in 32 years of business).

The summary of the case:

Hank Williams, Inc DBA: Williams Construction Contractors (WC) was awarded the construction contract to install a duct bank of 4" PVC conduit, for San Miguel Power Association (SMPA).

SMPA is the local electric provider CO-OP in the Norwood, CO area. The project is located near Illium Road west of Telluride, CO. The project began in April, 2017 and completed in December, 2017.

Williams Construction brought suit against SMPA for withholding approx. \$325,000.00 of retention, unpaid change order requests, and unpaid overage in excavation & export. Total suit is approx. \$1,150,000.00

SMPA has filed a counter suit against WC claiming road damage (pavement failure), excessive flow-fill quantities (flow-fill concrete was used as back-fill material to create the duct bank per plans), and lack of re-vegetation. SMPA's counter suit is approx. \$1.2 Million.

Case status:

Final depositions are to be taken on October 25, 2019, and Mediation is scheduled for December 13, 2019. If needed court is scheduled for February 24, 2020.

Williams Construction's Bonding Company (United Fire & Casualty Group) is fully aware of this suit and has provided WC two additional lawyers to serve as legal counsel in this matter.

No warranty claims have been made against WC, and the project has been utilized by the owner since its completion, as scheduled.

As stated above this is the first legal action that Williams Construction has ever brought against an owner, in 32 years of business. We are very optimistic that this issue can be resolved in Mediation. WC has worked with SMPA on numerous projects over the last 25 years, and we hope to settle this matter very soon.

Please contact me if there are any further questions.

Ward Priestley
Williams Construction
35550 4000 Rd
Norwood, CO 81423
(970) 729-0301 cell

Defendant Contact:

San Miguel Power Association
Brad Zaporski, CEO
720 N. Railroad St.

Ridgway, CO 81432
(970) 626-5549 office